

Personological Evaluation of Clance's Impostor Phenomenon Scale in a Korean Sample

Joon-Ho Chae, Ralph L. Piedmont, Barry K. Estadt, and
Robert J. Wicks

Loyola College

The purpose of this study was both to determine if the Impostor Phenomenon (IP) can be reliably and validly assessed in a Korean context and if so, evaluate the construct within the context of Jungian typology and the 5-factor model of personality. A sample of 654 Korean men and women were selected from 4 major Korean cities and administered the Clance Impostor Phenomenon Scale (CIPS; Clance & Imes, 1978) along with the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI, Form G; Myers & McCaulley, 1985) and NEO Personality Inventory-Revised (NEO-PI-R; Costa & McCrae, 1992). Results indicated that the CIPS was very reliable, and the pattern of correlates suggested impostors to be introverted types on the MBTI. Results with the NEO-PI-R showed impostors to be very high on neuroticism and low on conscientiousness. This pattern of correlates is similar to other performance-inhibiting constructs such as fear of success and fear of failure. It was argued that IP be construed more as a motivational style than as a distinct clinical syndrome. The IP seems to be less pervasive in Korea than America and these cross-cultural implications were discussed.

The Impostor Phenomenon (IP) can be described as an internal experience of fraudulence regarding one's success (Clance & Imes, 1978) and one's roles (Harvey & Katz, 1985). Clance and Imes first observed this subtle yet persistent emotional distress among highly successful professional women. The cause of this distress stemmed from an inability to internalize their success as legitimate. These women believed that they were not what they appeared to be. To the contrary of the objective evidence, they felt their success was not the result of their own ability, but rather due to luck or

personal charms. Impostors believed that others had overestimated their ability and talents, and they constantly worried about the possibility of being exposed as frauds. Later, Harvey and Katz began to notice this phenomenon not only among professionals but ordinary men and women as well. Many individuals have experienced a "feeling of phoniness in regard to their looks, social skills, family loyalties, social standings, and roles" (Harvey & Katz, p. 60). The IP feelings occurred when individuals began to doubt how well, or how sincerely, personal roles were being played, even though they appeared to others to be doing a good job.

The most difficult problem for impostors is the inability to break the so called *Impostor Cycle* (Clance, 1985). When impostors encounter a new task (e.g., exams), they are plagued by worry, self-doubt, and anxiety. In order to deal with anxiety, they either procrastinate or over-prepare for a task. When they actually encounter a new task, they often succeed and receive recognition and praise from others. This brings temporary elation, and relief. However, these new successes intensify their sense of fraudulence rather than helping them to build an enhanced sense of self-confidence. Thus, the same cycle of anxiety, over-preparation or procrastination, temporary relief, and self-doubt is repeated.

Since Clance and Imes (1978) originally proposed the IP syndrome, many researchers have studied the IP construct and related issues such as gender differences, attribution styles, and personality characteristics. From this body of research, several conclusions can be drawn. First, the IP construct has received some empirical validation (Cozzarelli & Major, 1990; Edwards, Zeichner, Lawler, & Kowalski, 1987; Harvey, 1981; Holmes, Kertay, Adamson, Holland, & Clance, 1993; Imes, 1979; Topping & Kimmel, 1985). Second, men and women experience the IP at similar rates (Cromwell, Brown, Sanchez-Huceles, & Adair, 1990; Edwards et al., 1987; Harvey, 1981; Imes, 1979). Finally, those who score high on the IP scale tend to attribute their success to external factors (e.g., luck) rather than internal factors (e.g., ability; Imes, 1979; Topping, 1983; Topping & Kimmel, 1985).

Based on a review of the evidence for the IP construct, two issues emerge that form the core of this report. First, although a number of studies have examined various personality correlates of the phenomenon, such efforts have been rather limited and the need exists to understand IP within the context of a larger, comprehensive framework of personality dimensions. Second, all the reviewed research focused exclusively on American samples. Therefore it needs to be determined if the IP construct is a Western culture-specific phenomenon or a human-wide syndrome. Each of these issues are discussed in turn.

PERSONOLOGICAL CORRELATES OF IP

A number of studies have attempted to discover some of the personality correlates of IP. Using the State-Trait Anxiety Inventory, Topping and Kim-

mel (1985) demonstrated that generalized anxiety was an important component of the impostor constellation. Casselman (1991) explored the association between IP and scores on the Eysenck Personality Inventory using medical students. Her study documented that Neuroticism was a significant predictor. Topping (1983) demonstrated that those with impostor feelings also have higher levels of achievement motivation. This suggested that impostors are trying to prove they are capable, competent, and worthwhile in order to eradicate their own personal sense of self-doubt. This finding helps to distinguish IP from other phenotypic phenomena like fear of failure or fear of success, where such individuals may make no effort to achieve or succeed.

Although much of the research on IP validates specific facets of the syndrome, very little research has attempted to integrate IP within a larger personality framework. Clearly emotional distress is an important component, but are there other individual difference dimensions that are also salient? In order to draw this broader personological sketch, one requires models of personality that are organized at a higher level than specific traits and also provide more complete descriptions of the spectrum of personality dimensions. Some researchers have already begun to move in this direction.

Lawler (1984) attempted to link IP within a Jungian typological framework. She administered the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) along with the Harvey Impostor Phenomenon Scale to 130 male and female undergraduate honors students and found that introverts were more likely than extraverts to experience IP and that Introverts who preferred sensing as their perceiving function were the most vulnerable. Similar findings were obtained by Crouch, Grant, Posner-Cahill, and Rose (1991), who gave the MBTI to over 140 male and female bankers and service professionals. They also noted that introversion was important for both genders and that service professionals were more vulnerable.

Both of these studies begin to outline the larger motivational dynamics of IP as well as providing etiological insights. However there are two limitations to typological research. The first problem is inherent to all typological models and concerns the ability of any limited number categories to capture and describe all people. There are always those who defy categorization or who fit into more than one category. Thus, the degree to which IP cannot be clearly located in a specific type will proportionally undermine efforts to define the syndrome. The second difficulty concerns the MBTI's ability to assess all relevant aspects of personality. The personality dimensions used by the MBTI to sort individuals into types may not exhaustively sample the entire personality domain. McCrae and Costa (1989) have shown that the MBTI does overlook some aspects of personality, most notably the domain of Neuroticism. As noted previously, this domain was shown to be an important correlate of IP. Thus, the MBTI cannot be counted on to provide a complete personological description of IP.

To insure a complete description of the impostor syndrome requires appeal to a comprehensive taxonomy of personality. Such a framework would provide a paradigm for evaluating, interpreting, and classifying the personal qualities of any psychological construct. Over the past 30 years, research has identified five major dimensions of personality that are considered to provide a sufficient taxonomic description of personality (Digman, 1990; Goldberg, 1993; McCrae & John, 1992). These dimensions are referred to as the five-factor model and consist of the domains: Neuroticism (N; the tendency to experience negative affect, such as anxiety, depression, and hostility), Extraversion (E; the quantity and intensity of interpersonal interaction), Openness (O; the proactive seeking and appreciation of new experiences), Agreeableness (A; the quality of one's interpersonal interactions along a continuum from compassion to antagonism), and Conscientiousness (C; the amount of persistence, organization, and motivation in goal-directed behaviors). These factors have been found to underlie constructs derived from a wide variety of theoretical models (McCrae & Costa, 1989; Noller, Law, & Comrey, 1987; Piedmont, McCrae, & Costa, 1991), and have also been shown to predict a number of salient life outcomes, such as job success, burnout, positive and negative life events, and coronary heart disease (Costa, McCrae, & Dembroski, 1989; Magnus, Diener, Fujita, & Pavot, 1993; Ormel & Wohlfarth, 1991; Piedmont, 1993; Piedmont & Weinstein, 1994).

Based on this research, it is clear that N, low E, and possibly C should be linked to IP. However, no research has yet shown how O and A may be linked. Given the distorted cognitive belief system of impostors and their inability to attribute success to their own efforts and ability, would they tend to be low on O? In their efforts to keep from being "discovered" as a fake, what type of interpersonal orientation do they maintain? Are they agreeable and personable or do they maintain hostilities towards and suspicions of the motives of others? No doubt an evaluation of IP within the context of this five-factor taxonomy will help to broaden our understanding of the phenomenon and facilitate its linkage to other nomologically relevant constructs.

CROSS-CULTURAL IMPLICATIONS FOR KOREA

IP is hypothesized to occur when individuals fail to internalize success in an achievement-related situation or when they fail to develop a congruence between the public appearance of their behavior and the private self-concept about their role (Clance & Imes, 1978; Harvey & Katz, 1985). In other words, in situations where individuals believe that they do not have the ability to accomplish goals expected of them by others, they begin to psychologically distance themselves from their role. As a result, feelings of hollowness are generated as these individuals continue to perform their duties and anticipations of imminent failure are created. It seems reasonable to speculate that in societies where roles and status are clearly defined and expecta-

tions about social behavior are enforced by larger group networks, the IP may be more prevalent. Because many Asian cultures are known for having more rigid social hierarchies, this study evaluates the degree to which the impostor construct can be reliably and validly translated into the Korean culture. If such a generalizability is possible, then the prevalence of the construct is evaluated. If IP is more common in a Korean sample, this may argue that the phenomenon develops within the socialization process of the individual.

This hypothesis is based on the characteristics of Korean culture. The basic philosophy of Korean culture has been Confucianism. One of the most important social norms in Confucianism is the rule of *li* (the behavior proper to one's role; Cheng, 1990). All people have their proper place in society, a role that is usually clearly defined and quite fixed. Not following the expected behaviors of a given role results in both a personal loss of face and a loss of face for the group. Thus, the individual's needs, feelings, thoughts, and behaviors tend to be less important than fulfilling the expected role in the community to which one belongs. Individual differences are acceptable only as long as they serve to fulfill the role of the person and the goals of the group. Given the rigidity of these role definitions, Koreans may be more likely to develop discrepancies between how they appear in public and what they experience within. This more regimented social nature of Korean society may lead individuals to interpret their successes more in terms of their role compliance than personal ability.

METHOD

Participants

Participants of this study were 654 Korean Catholics: 320 men and 334 women (270 laity and 384 religious) with a mean age of 34 years ($SD = 10.7$). These samples were obtained from four cities over the entire South Korean peninsula (Seoul, Pusan, Daegu, and ChunJu). The education level was high school or above. Participants were part of a larger study evaluating psychosocial dynamics in religious versus nonreligious vocations.

Measures

Clance Impostor Phenomenon Scale (CIPS). Developed by Clance and Imes (1978), this 20-item questionnaire presents items that capture various feelings of emptiness and conflict around success, such as "Sometimes I'm afraid others will discover how much knowledge or ability I really lack" and "Sometimes I feel or believe that my success in life or in my job has been the result of some kind of error." Items are responded to on a *not at all true* (1) to *very true* (5) Likert scale.

This scale has a high level of internal consistency (coefficient $\alpha = .96$) and has been shown to be relatively effective in differentiating impostors from nonimpostors in the general population. (Holmes et al., 1993). For the purposes of this study, this instrument was translated into Korean.

NEO Personality Inventory-Revised (NEO-PI-R). Developed by Costa and McCrae (1992), this 240-item questionnaire was developed through rational and factor analytic methods to measure the five major factors of personality: N, E, O, A, and C. For each factor, there are six facet scales that are designed to capture more specific traits. Items are answered on a 5-point scale ranging from *strongly agree* (1) to *strongly disagree* (5), and scales are balanced to control for the effects of acquiescence. Normative internal consistency estimates for the self-report version of the instrument for adults range from .59 to .92 (Costa & McCrae, 1992; McCrae & Costa, 1992). Six-year stability coefficients range from .68 to .83 for the N, E, and O domains and 3-year retest coefficients are from .63 to .79 for brief versions of the A and C domains (Costa & McCrae, 1988).

The NEO-PI-R has been validated in studies using other self-reports (Costa, McCrae, & Dye, 1991; Piedmont & Weinstein, 1993). Scales have shown evidence of convergent and discriminant validity across instruments, methods, and observers and have been related to a number of life outcomes, including frequency of somatic complaints, ability to cope with stress, burn-out, and occupational success (Costa & McCrae, 1989; McCrae & Costa, 1987; Piedmont, 1993, 1994; Piedmont & Weinstein, 1994).

MBTI. Form G (Myers & McCauley, 1985) was used in this study and has already been translated, normed, and validated in Korean (Sim, 1990; Sim & Kim, 1991, 1993). This form consists of 126 items, of which only 94 are scored. Only these items are included in the Korean version. Most items offer a forced choice between two responses, although some have more response options, and respondents are occasionally allowed to endorse two or more responses. Separate scoring keys are provided for each preference. Because the opposing preference scores are almost completely ipsative, they were not used in this study. Instead, the four continuous scores were employed. These scores correspond to the difference between opposing preferences and have a theoretical neutral point of 100.

Sim and Kim (1993) presented split-half reliability coefficients for a sample of 201 Koreans, which coefficients range from .72 for EI to .82 for JP. Also, test-retest correlations of continuous scores between the English and Korean versions were all above .90. The pattern of interscale correlations were also comparable to American normative data (Myers & McCauley, 1985). The MBTI has demonstrated reasonable construct validity through theoretically expected correlations with other instruments, such as the Jungian Type Survey (Wheelwright, Wheelwright, & Buehler, 1964), the

Barratt Impulsiveness Scale (Sipps & Dicaudo, 1988), the Strong Vocational Interest Blank and the Edwards Personal Preference Schedule (Myers & McCaulley, 1985), and by comparing the MBTI results with the self-assessment of type preferences (Carskadon, 1975, 1982). Finally, Sim and Kim (1993) have shown the Korean version to have strong discriminant validity and concluded that this version is an adequate representation of the constructs represented in the English version.

Demographic and Attribution Questionnaires. This instrument was designed by this study's researchers to elicit demographic data and attribution styles among the participants. The demographic items consisted of open-ended questions concerning the individual's gender, years of education, years in religious life, and years in current profession.

In order to assess performance attribution style, participants were asked: "When you experience some success in your ministry or work, to what degree do you believe the following factors contribute to that success?" Participants then rated on a 1 (*not influential*) to 7 (*very influential*) Likert scale the role of (a) luck, (b) the situation itself (e.g., it was an easy task), (c) their ability, and (d) their effort in obtaining that success (see Weiner, 1985). Responses to these questions would determine whether an individual attributed their success to either internal (e.g., ability, effort) or external (luck, situation) forces.

Procedure

Translation Process. Both the NEO-PI-R and CIPS needed to be translated into Korean. A multistep process was implemented. Initially, this study's first author (Chae) translated the instruments from English into Korean. These versions were then sent to two bilingual individuals unfamiliar with psychological constructs, who then back-translated these instruments into English. Next, this study's second author (Piedmont) compared the back-translated versions with the original English. Items that were not clear or did not satisfactorily capture the constructs being assessed were identified and, in discussion with the first author, new translations were made; these changes were sent to another two bilingual individuals. They retranslated the second Korean versions into English.

At this point, the translations were deemed appropriate and were then forwarded to the authors of the instruments for their approval and permission to use the new documents. The authors of NEO-PI-R identified some items they believed unclear. Those items were again retranslated and the items sent to another two bilingual people for back-translation. Finally, this translated revision of NEO-PI-R was sent to the authors and final approval was received. Therefore, the Korean instruments have solid face validity as being appropriate translations.

Research Procedure. The first author contacted the superiors, rectors, pastors, or appropriate representatives of the possible religious orders, congregations, and parishes in several Korean cities, explained the purpose of the research, and requested permission to solicit participants. Three female religious congregations, seven male religious congregations, eight parishes, one university pastoral care center, and one Catholic-run hospital gave permission to collect data. The first author visited each site and handed the questionnaires to the appropriate representative(s) of each institution. Then these representatives gathered the volunteers who were willing to participate in the study, distributed the questionnaires in person and asked them to answer the questionnaires either at the site or at home. When finished, participants brought back the completed questionnaires to their representative. After collecting all questionnaires, each representative delivered them to first author either by mail or in person.

Through this procedure, 800 questionnaires were distributed and 654 were completed and collected for an 82% response rate.

RESULTS

Reliability of the NEO-PI-R and CIPS in Korean

The overall alpha reliability of the CIPS was .84, indicating the scale to be reliable in this sample. The overall mean was 56.2 with a standard deviation of 9.7. No gender differences were noted. According to Holmes and colleagues (1993), this value is slightly higher than two samples of identified nonimpostors ($M_s = 46$ and 50) and much lower than two samples of identified impostors ($M_s = 70$ and 87).

The overall alpha reliability of the NEO-PI-R domain scales were .92, .84, .83, .80, and .89 for N, E, O, A, and C, respectively. These results are consistent with American normative data (Costa & McCrae, 1992).

In terms of gender differences, women scored higher than men on the A domain, $t(654) = 1.98, p < .05$, and C, $t(654) = 3.25, p < .01$, and lower on the E domain, $t(654) = -1.94, p < .05$. This result differs from the American normative data in that American women scored higher than men on N and on A. However, they did not find any gender differences on the E, O, and C domains.

When the means of each NEO-PI-R scale were compared with the American normative sample, Koreans, both men and women, scored higher on the N domain and lower on the E, O, and C domains than Americans. For the A domain, the mean scores were slightly higher for Korean men and lower for Korean women than their American counterparts. It needs to be determined whether these differences reflect properties of the translated scale or signal actual cultural differences. Nonetheless, the NEO-PI-R domain scales have sufficient reliability to warrant their use in this sample.

Finally, in order to demonstrate some evidence of construct validity for the NEO-PI-R, domain scores were correlated with the four MBTI continuous scores; the results are presented in Table 1. McCrae and Costa (1989) conducted a similar analysis with an American sample. Their results, as well as those for this sample, are found in Table 1. As can be seen, both the pattern and magnitude of the two matrices are very similar. For both data sets, N does not correlate very highly with any of the MBTI continuous scores. EI is highly associated, negatively, with E; SN is correlated with O; TF is related to high A and low C, and JP is correlated with low C. These data provide strong evidence that these two Korean versions yield scores that are highly analogous to those produced by their American versions.

Personological Implications of IP

Correlations between the NEO-PI-R and CIPS are found in Table 2. When the CIPS was correlated with the NEO-PI-R, the strongest associations were

TABLE 1
Correlations Between the NEO-PI-R and MBTI in Korean
and American Samples

NEO-PI-R Domain	MBTI Continuous Scores							
	Male Subjects				Female Subjects			
	EI	SN	TF	JP	EI	SN	TF	JP
American samples ^a								
N	.16**	-.06	.06	.11	.17*	.01	.28***	.04
E	-.74***	.10	.19**	.15*	-.69***	.22**	.10	.20**
O	.03	.72***	.02	.30***	-.03	.69***	-.02	.26***
A	-.03	.04	.44***	-.06	-.08	.03	.46***	.05
C	.08	-.15*	-.15*	-.49***	.08	-.10	-.22**	-.46***
Korean samples ^b								
N	.22***	.10	.12*	.21***	.18***	.13*	.08	.20***
E	-.71***	.14*	-.08	.04	-.73***	.13*	-.01	.07
O	-.25***	.49***	.11*	.16**	-.18***	.56***	.12*	.24***
A	.02	-.12*	.30***	-.10	.04	-.02	.20***	-.08
C	-.15**	-.15**	-.34***	-.56***	-.05	-.20***	-.29***	-.53***

Note. NEO-PI-R = NEO Personality Inventory-Revised, MBTI = Myers-Briggs Type Indicator.

^aAdapted from McCrae and Costa (1989, p. 30); $n = 267$ for men, $n = 201$ for women.

^bFrom this study's data set, $n = 319$ for men, $n = 334$ for women.

$p < .05$. ** $p < .01$. *** $p < .001$. Two-tailed tests.

TABLE 2
Correlations Between CIPS Scores and the NEO-PI-R Domain and Facet Scales, Separately by Gender

NEO-PI-R Domains and Facets	CIPS	
	Male Subjects ^a	Female Subjects ^b
Neuroticism	.60***	.63***
Anxiety	.52***	.53***
Hostility	.30***	.50***
Depression	.54***	.54***
Self-Consciousness	.49***	.57***
Impulsiveness	.49***	.35***
Vulnerability	.49***	.46***
Extraversion	-.13*	-.15**
Warmth	-.04	-.09
Gregariousness	-.08	-.23***
Assertiveness	-.26***	-.20***
Activity	-.10	-.04
Excitement Seeking	-.14**	.14**
Positive Emotions	-.16**	-.18***
Openness to Experience	-.03	-.01
Fantasy	.18***	.13**
Aesthetics	-.03	.03
Feelings	-.04	.08
Actions	-.05	-.18
Ideas	-.02	-.01
Values	-.18***	-.13*
Agreeableness	-.14*	-.18***
Trust	-.24***	-.31***
Straightforwardness	-.23***	-.18***
Altruism	-.07	-.14**
Compliance	.02	-.08
Modesty	.05	.12*
Tender-Mindedness	-.05	-.05
Conscientiousness	-.36***	-.29***
Competence	-.36***	-.31***
Order	-.15**	-.22***
Dutifulness	-.24***	-.19***
Achievement Striving	-.17**	-.07
Self-Discipline	-.45***	-.33***
Deliberation	-.24***	-.17**

Note. CIPS = Clance Imposter Phenomenon Scale, NEO-PI-R = NEO Personality Inventory-Revised.

^a*n* = 319. ^b*n* = 334.

p* < .05. *p* < .01. ****p* < .001. Two-tailed tests.

found with the N domain, $r_s = .60$ and $.63$, $p_s < .001$ for male and female participants, respectively, and C domain, $r_s = -.36$ and $-.29$, $p_s < .001$ for male and female participants, respectively. These results suggested that a high level of negative emotion and poor impulse control appear to be the core elements of the IP. An inspection of the facet correlations to the CIPS shows high scorers to be anxious, depressed, emotionally unstable, prone to psychological distress, and negative affect. Further, they tend to be less competent and to procrastinate, are easily discouraged, and tend to avoid hard work (McCrae & Costa, 1992).

The negative correlations with the E and A domains suggest an interpersonal style that is characterized as glum, detached, uncommunicative, aloof, and skeptical (Hofstee, de Raad, & Goldberg, 1992). Such individuals are introverted and suspicious of the motives of others. More than likely, these individuals avoid close contact with others, believing that they may be exposed as fakes. This interpretation is consistent with the negative associations found between the CIPS and the Assertiveness and Trust facets of the NEO-PI-R.

Scores on the CIPS scale were correlated with self-reported scores on the MBTI and select demographic and attribution variables. These results are presented in Table 3. Concerning the MBTI, it can be seen that the CIPS

TABLE 3
Correlations Between Scores on CIPS and the MBTI, Demographic, and Attribution Scales

Measures	CIPS	
	Male Subjects ^a	Female Subjects ^b
MBTI		
Introversion-extroversion	-.21***	-.24***
Intuiting-sensing	-.06	-.07
Feeling-thinking	-.05	-.02
Perceiving-judging	-.09	-.11*
Demographics		
Age	-.10	-.15**
Education level	-.03	.02
Attribution ratings		
Ability	-.27***	-.18**
Effort	-.18***	-.10
Situation	.13*	.07
Luck	.21***	.18**

Note. CIPS = Clance Impostor Phenomenon Scale, MBTI = Myers-Briggs Type Indicator.

^a $n = 319$. ^b $n = 334$.

* $p < .05$. ** $p < .01$. *** $p < .001$. Two-tailed tests.

correlated the strongest with the IE score, $r_s = -.21$ and $-.24$, $p_s < .001$ for male and female participants, respectively. These associations portray the high IP scorer as being an introverted type: they are more comfortable with their own inner world and do not appreciate structure or order imposed on their activities. Such individuals will tend to blame themselves when things go wrong (Myers & McCaulley, 1985).

Other Correlates of IP

Also of interest in Table 3 are the findings of no significant associations between IP and gender and education. However, age did appear to have a slight association for female participants, $r(332) = -.15$, $p < .01$, suggesting that younger women had higher scores. Thus, there may be a developmental aspect to this phenomenon. Attribution ratings of performance were also correlated with IP scores, and the results indicated that impostors saw their success less a result of their own internal efforts (low ability ratings) and more a consequence of events unfolding in very felicitous ways (high luck ratings). Impostors see their success as a function of mostly external, unstable factors rather than internal, stable factors. Thus impostors do not have confidence in their ability to repeat any success.

Prevalence of IP in Korean Sample

Previous research using the CIPS has identified scores of 58 and 62 as useful cutoffs for identifying impostors (Holmes et al., 1993). Using these values, 39% and 24%, respectively, of this sample would be regarded as impostors. These values are much less than estimates found in American samples, which for certain groups have been found to range as high as 93%, but mostly cluster in the 60% to 70% range (Clance, 1985; Harvey & Katz, 1985).

Another way of approaching the prevalence issue was to use the attribution ratings for the selection criteria. Given that ratings of ability and luck were most strongly correlated with IP scores, ratings on these dimensions were standardized and those participants having z scores of $+.50$ or greater on the luck dimension and z scores of $-.50$ or less on the ability dimension were categorized as impostors, whereas those with a reverse pattern of scores were categorized as nonimpostors. A total of 98 participants were identified by this process, with 54 (approximately 8% of the total sample) emerging as impostors.

A t test indicated that the mean of this impostor group ($M = 60.56$) was significantly higher than the mean of the identified nonimpostor group ($M = 51.66$), $t(96) = 4.40$, $p < .001$. Using 56 as a cutoff (the point equidistant

from the two group means), 73% of this subsample were accurately classified. This represents about an 18% gain over chance. Using this cutoff in the overall sample would identify 53% as impostors.¹

DISCUSSION

The results of this study clearly demonstrate that the IP can be reliably translated into Korean and does represent a valid construct in that context. Consistent with results from American studies, correlations between CIPS scores and the MBTI showed the CIPS to be most highly correlated with Introverted types of individuals. However, unlike results with Americans, CIPS scores did not correlate with the Feeling type. The results with the MBTI show impostors to be concerned more with their inner rather than outer world. Impostors are contemplative, detached, and seek solitude and privacy. However, it is not clear whether this introverted tendency intensifies their impostor feelings or if their feelings of fraudulence force them to be more introverted.

Correlations with the translated version of the NEO-PI-R showed substantially higher correlations with CIPS scores than found with the MBTI. Of particular note was the very high association with N. Such a correlation suggests that emotional dysphoria is at the heart of this phenomenon. Anxiety, depression, low self-esteem, and poor coping ability seem to play a central role. Although appearing unruffled on the outside, impostors are quite distressed internally, extremely sensitive to criticism, and prone to intense feelings of inadequacy. Also relevant was the negative correlation with C. Such a finding suggests that impostors also have a lower sense of competence and are less self-disciplined. This is inconsistent with Topping's (1983) results, which suggested higher levels of C. This discrepancy may reflect a significant cultural difference. Nonetheless, the lower aspiration levels of impostors in this sample suggest that some of the anxiety these individuals have about being able to perform successfully achievement-related tasks may be reality based.

Evaluating the IP construct within the five-factor taxonomy provides an opportunity to establish the variable within a larger nomological net. The correlations of the CIPS with high N and low C provide some important insights. In a study evaluating the personological qualities of several perfor-

¹It could be argued that although an 82% return rate is very good, the 18% who did not respond may have constituted a disproportionately high percentage of impostors. This would mean that our data underestimate the true IP prevalence rate. This hypothesis can be evaluated in our data set. If those who were the most distressed were more likely not to respond to our questionnaires, then we would also expect that scores on the NEO-PI-R N scale, another measure of affective distress, would also be attenuated. An inspection of this distribution shows a relatively normal distribution of *T*-scores ranging from 12 to 82. Thus, it appears unlikely that any significant selection bias exists in the data.

mance-related motivational variables (e.g., achievement motivation, fear of failure, fear of success), Piedmont (1995) noted that these constructs were also well defined by a circumplex structure that was anchored by the N and C domains. Specifically, performance-enhancing variables occupied the high C, low N quadrant, whereas the performance-inhibiting variables were found in the low C, high N quadrant. Thus, IP may have a motivational basis similar to fear of success and fear of failure.

If indeed IP occupies a specific bandwidth along a larger motivational spectrum, than it may not be useful to conceive of the construct as a discrete clinical syndrome. IP may not represent anything that is essentially dysfunctional or disordered. Rather, it may be a particular motivational style—a tendency to avoid competitive situations. Of course, future research is needed to help disentangle these issues. If IP represents a distinct clinical category, then there should exist a very clear threshold distinguishing those with the syndrome from those without it. The strong correlations with N and C suggest more of a gradual, dimensional reality.

Another issue that argues for the dimensional interpretation is the inability to identify any consistent cutoff score for impostors (e.g., Holmes et al., 1993). Many studies merely used median splits for categorizing impostors, but this method is problematic for two reasons. First, it begs the larger nosologic question because no attempt is made at identifying any specific diagnostic information. Second, given that relatively small samples were used, the median value varied from study to study resulting in no consistent, valid cutoff score. Overall, the prevalence of IP was smaller in this sample than in American samples. When an external criterion was used to select impostors (i.e., attribution ratings), the percentage was quite low (8%). Of course, this discrepancy in prevalence may be culturally based (those implications are discussed later), but we believe that the variability in proposed cutoff scores and the consequent differences in estimates of prevalence (as high as 93% in some samples; Stahl, Turner, & Weaver, cited in Clance, 1985) warrant a more dimensional approach to the construct.

Cross-Cultural Implications of IP

As noted, the prevalence of IP in this Korean sample was much less than found in studies with Americans. This is surprising given the outline of Korean society discussed earlier. It may be possible that a more clearly defined social hierarchy provides a better sense of identity to individuals. Rather than creating an increased sense of incongruity between one's thoughts and behaviors, clearly defined roles may provide a structure for facilitating interpersonal involvement that enables greater personal development. Rather than promoting hollowness, clearly defined roles may augment feelings of accomplishment and personal self-efficacy.

This reasoning is consistent with IP research on role unfamiliarity. Clance and Imes (1978) reported that many of their clients complained of impostor

feelings when they entered new roles. In order to test this hypothesis, Harvey (1981) correlated IP scores with number of years a student had been in school. If Clance and Imes' clinical observations held true, then the 1st-year students would have higher IP mean scores than 4th-year students. The results confirmed this hypothesis. The negative correlation between age and IP found in this study may be further affirmation of this hypothesis. Younger individuals, who are developing into their roles and beginning to orient themselves towards a particular life trajectory, may experience some hesitations and discomfort with their newfound autonomy and responsibility. As they gain more familiarity with their role, a greater sense of personal ownership may emerge and the impostor feelings may fade away. This is certainly an area for future research to explore. One note of caution: The correlational nature of these data may be masking real cohort differences. Only longitudinal research can conclusively confirm the impact of role familiarity on IP.

In any event, cross-cultural research on the IP can provide a useful point of departure for future research. Cross-validating the construct in other cultures that are known to be different in specific ways can give clues concerning the etiology, structure, and prognosis of the construct. The results presented here may suggest that the multiplicity of roles a given individual plays in American society, coupled with the ambiguity that surrounds all roles, may be fostering higher levels of IP. Perhaps providing more defined or stereotypic role structures may help ease this problem.

Caveats

Although this study demonstrated that the IP construct can be reliably and validly translated into a non-Western culture, two caveats need mentioning. First, this sample consists entirely of Catholics and as such may not be completely representative of the entire Korean population. Although there is no reason to believe that Catholics would be lower on IP than non-Catholics, the lower estimates of IP prevalence presented here need to be regarded cautiously until more representative Korean samples can be collected. Nonetheless, this sample can serve as a useful reference point for future research with Koreans. Further, because this sample is not demographically analogous to samples collected in America, care needs to be taken in comparing prevalence rates between these two cultures.

Second, many of the correlations between the IP scores and external criteria were small in magnitude (e.g., $< .20$). Interpretations were provided for some of these relations if: (a) such an association was found in previous research or (b) if the relation was consistent with the theory underlying the construct. Given the exploratory nature of this study, these smaller coefficients are best viewed as hypotheses for future research.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

For a copy of the Korean translation of the IP scale, contact Joon-Ho Chae, SJ., The Society of Jesus in Korea, MAPO P.O. Box 44, Seoul, 121-600, South Korea. For information about the Korean translation of the NEO-PI-R, contact Psychological Assessment Resources, P.O. Box 998, Odessa, FL 33556.

REFERENCES

- Carskadon, T. G. (1975). Myers-Briggs Type Indicator. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, *41*, 461-473.
- Carskadon, T. G. (1982). Sex differences in test-retest reliabilities on Form G of the MBTI. *Research in Psychological Type*, *2*, 83-84.
- Casselman, S. E. (1991). *The impostor phenomenon in medical students: Personality correlates and development issues*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Old Dominion University, Norfolk, VA.
- Cheng, S. K. (1990). Understanding the culture and behavior of East Asians: A Confucian perspective. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, *24*, 510-515.
- Clance, P. R. (1985). *The impostor phenomenon: Overcoming the fear that haunts your success*. Atlanta: Peachtree.
- Clance, P. R., & Imes, S. A. (1978). The impostor phenomenon in high achieving women: Dynamics and therapeutic intervention. *Psychotherapy Theory, Research and Practice*, *15*, 241-247.
- Costa, P. T., Jr., & McCrae, R. R. (1988). Personality in adulthood: A six-year longitudinal study of self-reports and spouse ratings on the NEO personality inventory. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *54*, 853-863.
- Costa, P. T., Jr., & McCrae, R. R. (1989). Personality, stress, & coping: Some lessons from a decade of research. In K. S. Markides & C. L. Cooper (Eds.), *Aging, Stress, and Health* (pp. 267-283). New York: Wiley.
- Costa, P. T., Jr., & McCrae, R. R. (1992). *Revised NEO Personality Inventory: Professional manual*. Odessa, FL: Psychological Assessment Resources.
- Costa, P. T., Jr., McCrae, R. R., & Dembroski, T. M. (1989). Agreeableness vs. antagonism: Explication of a potential risk factor for CHD. In A. Siegman & T. M. Dembroski (Eds.), *In search of coronary-prone behavior: Beyond Type A* (pp. 41-63). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Costa, P. T., Jr., McCrae, R. R., & Dye, D. A. (1991). Facet scales for agreeableness and conscientiousness: A revision of the NEO Personality Inventory. *Personality and Individual Differences*, *12*, 887-898.
- Cozzarelli, C., & Major, B. (1990). Exploring the validity of the impostor phenomenon. *Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology*, *9*, 401-417.
- Cromwell, B., Brown, N. W., Sanchez-Huceles, J., & Adair, F. L. (1990). The impostor phenomenon and personality characteristics of high school honor students. *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality*, *5*, 563-573.
- Crouch, J. G., Grant, C., Posner-Cahill, C., & Rose, A. (1991). Impostor phenomenon and psychological type among banking and higher education professionals. *Journal of Psychological Type*, *20*, 34-42.

- Digman, J. M. (1990). Personality structure: Emergence of the five-factor model. *Annual Review of Psychology*, *41*, 417-440.
- Edwards, P. W., Zeichner, A., Lawler, N., & Kowalski, R. (1987). A validation study of the Harvey Impostor Phenomenon Scale. *Psychotherapy*, *24*, 256-259.
- Goldberg, L. R. (1993). The structure of phenotypic personality traits. *American Psychologist*, *48*, 26-34.
- Harvey, J. C. (1981). The impostor phenomenon and achievement: A failure to internalize success (Doctoral dissertation, Temple University, Philadelphia, 1981). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, *42*, 4969B.
- Harvey, J. C., and Katz, C. (1985). *If I'm so successful, why do I feel like a fake?: The impostor phenomenon*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Hofstee, W. K. B., de Raad, B., & Goldberg, L. R. (1992). Integration of the big five and circumplex approaches to trait structure. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *63*, 146-163.
- Holmes, S. W., Kertay, L., Adamson, L. B., Holland, C. L., & Clance, P. R. (1993). Measuring the impostor phenomenon: A comparison of Clance's IP Scale and Harvey's I-P Scale. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, *60*, 48-59.
- Imes, S. A. (1979). The impostor phenomenon as a function of attribution patterns and internalized femininity/masculinity in high achieving women and men (Doctoral dissertation, Georgia State University, 1979). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, *40*, 5868B.
- Lawler, K. N. (1984). The impostor phenomenon in high achieving persons and Jungian personality variables (Doctoral dissertation, Georgia State University, 1984). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, *45B*, 2693B.
- Magnus, K., Diener, E., Fujita, F., & Pavot, W. (1993). Extraversion and neuroticism as predictors of objective life events: A longitudinal analysis. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *65*, 1046-1053.
- McCrae, R. R., & Costa, P. T., Jr. (1987). Validation of the five-factor model of personality across instruments and observers. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *52*, 81-90.
- McCrae, R. R., & Costa, P. T., Jr. (1989). Reinterpreting the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator from the perspective of the five-factor model of personality. *Journal of Personality*, *57*, 17-40.
- McCrae, R. R., & Costa, P. T., Jr. (1992). Discriminant validity of NEO-PI-R facet scales. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, *52*, 229-237.
- McCrae, R. R., & John, O. P. (1992). An introduction to the five-factor model and its application. *Journal of Personality*, *60*, 175-211.
- Myers, I. B., & McCaulley, M. H. (1985). *Manual: A guide to the development and use of the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator*. Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press.
- Noller, P., Law, H., & Comrey, A. L. (1987). Cattell, Comrey, and Eysenck personality factors compared: More evidence for the five robust factors? *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *53*, 775-782.
- Ormel, J., & Wohlfarth, T. (1991). How neuroticism, long term difficulties, and life situations change influence psychological distress: A longitudinal model. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *60*, 744-755.
- Piedmont, R. L. (1993). A longitudinal analysis of burnout in the health care setting: The role of personal dispositions. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, *61*, 457-473.
- Piedmont, R. L. (1994). Validation of the NEO PI-R observer form for college students: Towards a paradigm for studying personality development. *Assessment*, *1*, 259-268.
- Piedmont, R. L. (1995). Another look at fear of success, fear of failure, and test anxiety: A motivational analysis using the five-factor model. *Sex Roles*, *32*, 139-158.
- Piedmont, R. L., McCrae, R. R., & Costa, P. T., Jr. (1991). Adjective Check List Scales and the five-factor model. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *60*, 630-637.
- Piedmont, R. L., & Weinstein, H. P. (1993). A psychometric evaluation of the new NEO PI-R facet scales for agreeableness and conscientiousness. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, *60*,

- 302-318.
- Piedmont, R. L., & Weinstein, H. P. (1994). Predicting supervisor ratings of job performance using the NEO Personality Inventory. *Journal of Psychology, 128*, 255-265.
- Sim, H-S. (1990). *A cross-cultural study of a personality inventory: The development and validation of the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator in the Korean language*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, St. Louis University, MO.
- Sim, H-S., & Kim, J-T. (1991). *Myers-Briggs Type Indicator manual in Korean*. Seoul, Korea: Korean Psychological Testing Institution.
- Sim, H-S., & Kim, J-T. (1993). The development and validation of the Korean version of the MBTI. *Journal of Psychological Type, 26*, 18-27.
- Sipps, G. J., & Dicaudo, J. (1988). Convergent and discriminant validity of the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator as a measure of sociability and impulsivity. *Educational and Psychological Measurement, 48*, 445-451.
- Topping, M. E. (1983). The impostor phenomenon: A study of its construct and incidence in university faculty members (Doctoral dissertation, University of South Florida, 1983). *Dissertation Abstracts International, 44*, 1948B. (University Microfilms, No. 8316534)
- Topping, M. E., & Kimmel, E. B. (1985). The impostor phenomenon: Feeling phony. *Academic Psychology Bulletin, 7*, 213-226.
- Weiner, B. (1985). *Human motivation*. New York: Springer-Verlag.
- Wheelwright, J. B., Wheelwright, J. H., & Buehler, H. A. (1964). *Jungian Type Survey: The Gray-Wheelwright test* (16th rev.). San Francisco: Society of Jungian Analysts of Northern California.

Ralph L. Piedmont
Department of Pastoral Counseling
Loyola College in Maryland
7135 Minstrel Way
Columbia, MD 21045

Received October 14, 1994
Revised February 24, 1995

